

# Health, Development, and Human Rights

**Units** 9.0  
**Time** Monday, Wednesday: 1:00–2:20PM  
**Location** CMUQ 2163

**Instructor** David Emmanuel Gray  
**Contact** CMUQ 1039, [degray@qatar.cmu.edu](mailto:degray@qatar.cmu.edu)  
**Office hours** walk in or by appointment

---

## Course Overview

### Description

Around 1.1 billion people live on less than one dollar a day, in a condition the World Bank refers to as extreme poverty. Those who live in extreme poverty frequently lack effective access to proper nutrition, adequate shelter, safe drinking water, and sanitation. As a result, they also bear the greatest burdens of famine and epidemic disease, and they frequently face social and political conditions of unrest and systematic oppression.

In this course, we will pursue the question of what, if anything, we in technologically and economically developed nations owe to the global poor. It therefore focuses considerable attention on competing theories of global distributive justice, as well as the relationship between poverty, health, and human rights. We will critically examine different strategies for international development that emphasize one or more of these three things, and we will consider how information about their complex interrelationships should be factored into the development process.

We begin the course by briefly reviewing the role that social institutions, like those making up the Bretton Woods Institutions (the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund), play in assessing and responding to extreme poverty in the developing world. This will also allow us to gather some initial data concerning the causes of extreme poverty and understand those areas of the world especially affected by it. The majority of the course is then spent assessing several different claims about the developing world's obligation, or lack thereof, to those in extreme poverty. This will involve considering several competing theories of justice. We then end the course by looking at how these various theories influence actual proposals for international aid. One particular area we consider is the role of profits and patents on life-saving medication for those in the developing world.

### Readings

All articles are available in PDF format on Blackboard. You should print these out and read them in advance of the day each is discussed in class, as indicated on the schedule. It is also advisable to bring your hardcopies to class the day they are discussed.

### Objectives

By the end of this term, I expect that you will be able to:

- Assess competing claims concerning what citizens in developed nations owe to those in extreme poverty,
- Form a considered position concerning what you judge to be the most appropriate response to global poverty, and
- Communicate your analysis of these issues through both verbal and written discourse.

Each course requirement is designed with these objectives in mind.

### Announcements and Other Communication

Important course information will be posted on Blackboard, so please routinely check for updates at

<http://blackboard.qatar.cmu.edu>

Otherwise, I am glad to answer your questions, discuss your work, or respond to your concerns. Please stop by my office or get in touch via email.

### Requirements and Grading

Philosophy is a full-contact sport, but conducted as a cooperative process. Together, we wrestle with arguments and not attack the people advocating them. Classes will typically follow a seminar format, driven by classroom discussions of the readings and the arguments they contain. As a result, the quality of the course depends critically on each individual's attention and participation. The purpose of us coming together as a class is to practice the activity of philosophical thinking and reflection collectively.

I strongly encourage you to discuss the course's material outside of class with your fellow classmates, friends, and family, as well as with myself. However, all work must be done independently, unless otherwise noted. You are all expected to be familiar with the university policies on cheating and plagiarism. If you have any questions, please ask; do not assume.

**Assignments** include 2 short analytical summaries, 1 short position paper, and 3 analytical essays. Please refer to page 2 for details.

Each assignment will be graded on a 100-point scale. Unless you are notified of otherwise, the grading distribution will be as follows:

90.0–100	A	70.0–79.9	C	0.00–59.9	R
80.0–89.9	B	60.0–69.9	D		

Your final course grade will be on the same 100-point scale, with each assignment weighted as indicated on page 2.

If during the semester you wish to know how you are currently doing in more specific terms than what you can infer from this information, do not hesitate to meet with me. Please note, however: due to Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA) regulations, *I will not transmit grade information over email*. All discussion of grades must be done face-to-face with me.

### Late Policy

In general, no late submissions will be accepted unless a prior reasonable accommodation with me has been requested and granted. Exceptions are made for extreme circumstances, but you must make arrangements with me in advance whenever possible.

### Participation and Attendance

Every class meeting will involve all of us actively *doing* philosophy, rather than passively learning what others may say about philosophical issues. As such, attendance and participation are very important. I expect you to show up to class on time, participate thoughtfully, ask questions when you are confused, take notes, and have a grasp of what was accomplished in each meeting. *Attendance is therefore required, and anyone showing up more than 15 minutes late will be politely asked to leave and come back (on time) to our next class meeting.* To enforce this policy, I will promptly take attendance at the beginning of each class (that is, at 1:00PM). If you arrive after I have called your name, then you will be marked as tardy. However, I recognize that not everybody is comfortable speaking in class, and so only absences (in body or mind) will lower your grade. Nevertheless, active class participation can increase your grade. Please refer to page 2 for details.

---

# Assignments

## Reading

Most days of class will have an assigned reading (see the schedule on pages 3 and 4) that you will be expected to have read and thought about *before* class. This will allow us to devote our time to discussing and assessing the texts rather than simply reviewing their contents. Hence, you need to do more than merely peruse the readings: you must endeavor to understand what the texts are trying to convey. Keep in mind that reading philosophy is not like reading a novel. There will be times when you have to read slowly and carefully. Sometimes you may have to stop and think about things; and you should be prepared to go back and reread paragraphs if necessary. In some cases, multiple readings of the text may be necessary. However, I strive to keep reading assignments manageable in size so that this is feasible. In addition, it is always good to take notes while reading, so that you can remember the text's main points. Finally, feel free to bring questions to class. This material is hardly obvious and it challenges the most intelligent of people.

## Participation (10% of Final Grade)

Your base participation grade will be on the 100-point scale and will consist of your overall grade on all graded assignments (e.g., if the weighted average of your papers is an 86.5, then your base participation grade is also an 86.5, or a B). Each class absence will lower your participation grade by 10 points (i.e., one letter grade), while each time you are tardy will lower it by 5 points (i.e., one-half of a letter grade). Being caught sleeping in class, using your cell phone, leaving the classroom, or similar behavior will be treated as an absence or as tardiness depending on the particulars of the circumstances. Note that it is possible that your participation grade can go negative because of these penalties.

On the other hand, active and productive class participation can boost your participation grade by up to 20 points (i.e., two letter grades). In addition, if you have perfect attendance and no penalties on your participation grade, then your participation grade will be automatically boosted an additional 10 points. Consequently it is possible that your participation grade could go well above 100 points. Strive for this—it is the easiest way to increase your final course grade if you are in a borderline situation!

## Short Analytical Summaries (10% of Final Grade)

There will be two short analytical summaries, each of which will count for 5% towards your final course grade. Each consists of a brief (700 words, or about 2 pages) summary of an argument presented in the reading, but without providing any critically commentary of that argument. The purpose of these summaries is to practice taking a longer argument and condensing it down to a concise statement of (a) the main conclusion, (b) the set of premises, reasons, or evidence that are offered as support for that conclusion, and (c) how those premises are supposed to support or otherwise entail the conclusion. More details concerning each summary will be announced and discussed in class. Each analytical summary will be graded on the 100-point scale and will not be curved. Grading rubrics will be provided.

## Short Position Paper (5% of Final Grade)

There will be one short position paper, which will count for 5% towards your final course grade. It will consist of a brief (700 words, or about 2 pages) argument supporting a particular claim or conclusion. The purpose of this paper is to practice building a reasoned argument in support of a position of your own on a given issue. In this paper, you are asked to (a) state concisely your central claim and then (b) demonstrate how this conclusion is supported or entailed by premises, reasons, and/or evidence that are plausible in their own right or difficult to deny. More details concerning the position paper will be announced and discussed in class. The position paper will be graded on the 100-point scale and will not be curved. A grading rubric will be provided.

## Analytical Essays (75% of Final Grade)

There will be three analytical essays, each of which will count for 25% towards your final course grade. Each consists of a medium-length (1400 words, or about 4 pages) analysis of an issue raised by the reading and covered in class. The purpose of these essays is to demonstrate your ability to (a) reconstruct and critically evaluate important philosophical arguments and (b) to construct a reasoned argument in support of a considered position or claim. As such, these essays utilize all the skills practiced in your analytical summaries and your position paper. More details concerning each essay will be announced and discussed in class. Each analytical essay will be graded on the 100-point scale and will not be curved. Grading rubrics will be provided.

# Schedule

wk	Date	Topic/Readings	Assignments
1	1/10 (Mon)	<b>Introduction</b>	Topic for analytical summary #1 handed out.
	1/12 (Wed)	<b>Health, Wealth, and Social Institutions in an Interconnected World (Unit #1)</b> Assorted background reading on various international organizations, such the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Trade Organization (WTO).	
2	1/16 (Sun)		Analytical summary #1 due by 12:00PM (noon) via TurnItIn.
	1/17 (Mon)	<b>Health, Wealth, and Social Institutions in an Interconnected World</b> Eileen Stillwaggon, "AIDS and Poverty in Africa: Prevention and Treatment Require a Focus on Overall Health and Development".	
	1/19 (Wed)	<b>Health, Wealth, and Social Institutions in an Interconnected World</b> World Bank, <i>World Development Report</i> , Overview and Chapter 1.	
3	1/24 (Mon)	<b>Skepticism About Global Justice (Unit #2)</b> Thomas Hobbes, <i>Leviathan</i> , Chapters XI, XIII, and XIV.	Topic for analytical summary #2 handed out.
	1/26 (Wed)	<b>Skepticism About Global Justice</b> Thomas Hobbes, <i>Leviathan</i> , Chapters XV, XVII, and XVIII.	
4	1/30 (Sun)		Analytical summary #2 due by 12:00PM (noon) via TurnItIn.
	1/31 (Mon)	<b>Skepticism About Global Justice</b> Garrett Hardin, "Living on a Lifeboat". Garrett Hardin, "The Feast of Malthus".	
	2/2 (Wed)	<b>Skepticism About Global Justice</b> Amartya Sen, <i>Development as Freedom</i> , Chapters 7 and 9.	Topic for position paper handed out.
5	2/7 (Mon)	<b>Skepticism About Global Justice</b> Amartya Sen, <i>Development as Freedom</i> , Chapters 6 and 8.	
	2/9 (Wed)	<b>Libertarian Responses: Negative Duties and Global Resources (Unit #3)</b> John Locke, <i>Second Treatise of Government</i> , Chapters 1–6.	
6	2/13 (Sun)		Position paper due by 12:00PM (noon) via TurnItIn.
	2/14 (Mon)	<b>Libertarian Responses: Negative Duties and Global Resources</b> John Locke, <i>Second Treatise of Government</i> , Chapters 7–9, 11, 13.	
	2/16 (Wed)	<b>Libertarian Responses: Negative Duties and Global Resources</b> Robert Nozick, <i>Anarchy, State, and Utopia</i> , Chapter 7.	Topic for analytical essay #1 handed out.
7	2/21 (Mon)	<b>Libertarian Responses: Negative Duties and Global Resources</b> Brian Barry, "Humanity and Justice in Global Perspective".	
	2/23 (Wed)	<b>Libertarian Responses: Negative Duties and Global Resources</b> Thomas Pogge, <i>World Poverty and Human Rights</i> , "General Introduction".	
	2/28, 3/2	 <b>Spring Break</b>	
8	3/7 (Mon)	<b>Libertarian Responses: Negative Duties and Global Resources</b> Thomas Pogge, "Eradicating Global Poverty: Brief for a Global Resources Dividend".	
	3/9 (Wed)	<b>Libertarian Responses: Negative Duties and Global Resources</b> Mathias Risse, "Do We Owe the Global Poor Assistance or Rectification".	
9	3/13 (Sun)		Analytical essay #1 due by 12:00PM (noon) via TurnItIn.
	3/14 (Mon)	<b>Welfare, Humanity, and Human Rights (Unit #4)</b> The General Assembly of the United Nations, "Universal Declaration of Human Rights". James Nickel, "Poverty and Rights".	
	3/16 (Wed)	<b>Welfare, Humanity, and Human Rights</b> Martha Nussbaum, "Women and Equality: The Capabilities Approach".	

wk	Date	Topic/Readings	Assignments
10	3/21 (Mon)	<b>Welfare, Humanity, and Human Rights</b> Onora O'Neil, "The Dark Side of Human Rights".	
	3/23 (Wed)	<b>Welfare, Humanity, and Human Rights</b> Peter Singer, "Famine, Affluence, and Morality".	Topic for analytical essay #2 handed out.
11	3/28 (Mon)	<b>Welfare, Humanity, and Human Rights</b> James S. Fishkin, <i>The Limits of Obligation</i> , Chapters 4 and 9.	
	3/30 (Wed)	<b>International Aid: From Theory to Practice (Unit #5)</b> William R. Easterly, <i>The Elusive Quest for Growth: Economists' Adventures and Misadventures in the Tropics</i> , Chapter 2.	
12	4/4 (Mon)	<b>International Aid: From Theory to Practice</b> Jeffrey D. Sachs, <i>The End of Poverty: Economic Possibilities for Our Time</i> , Chapter 13.	
	4/6 (Wed)	<b>International Aid: From Theory to Practice</b> Andrew Kuper, "More Than Charity: Cosmopolitan Alternatives to the 'Singer Solution'".	
13	4/10 (Sun)		Analytical essay #2 due by 12:00PM (noon) via TurnItIn.
	4/11 (Mon)	<b>International Aid: From Theory to Practice</b> Dale Jamieson, "Duties to the Distant: Aid Assistance, and Intervention in the Developing World".	Topic for analytical essay #3 handed out.
	4/13 (Wed)	<b>International Aid: From Theory to Practice</b> Esther Duflo and Michael Kremer, "Use of Randomization in the Evaluation of Development Effectiveness".	
14	4/18 (Mon)	<b>Patents on Life-Saving Medication (Unit #6)</b> David Barnard, "In the High Court of South Africa, Case No. 4138/98: The Global Politics of Access to Low-Cost AIDS Drugs in Poor Countries".	
	4/20 (Wed)	<b>Patents on Life-Saving Medication</b> Amir Attaran, "How Do Patents And Economic Policies Affect Access To Essential Medicines In Developing Countries?"	
	4/26 (Tue)		Analytical essay #3 due by 12:00PM (noon) via TurnItIn.

---

# Policies

## Reasonable Accommodations

I recognize that you are a human being with occasional human problems associated with human finitude. Illness, family emergencies, job interviews, other professors, etc. . . will inevitably lead to legitimate conflicts over your time. If you expect that you will be missing class or be unable to turn in an assignment on time, please notify me (either in class or via email) *in advance* and we can agree on a reasonable accommodation. Arrangements after the fact will only be made in extraordinary, documented circumstances.

## Challenging an Assignment Grade

Please recognize that I am human also: mistakes will occasionally occur when grading your assignments. Therefore, you have *one week* after an assignment is handed back to challenge its grade. To do so, you must return the assignment to me along with a clearly written explanation of your reason for challenging its grade. I will promptly and seriously consider all such requests and meet with you, if necessary, to resolve them. Assignments without a written explanation will not be considered. After one week, no challenges will be accepted, except in extraordinary, documented circumstances. Of course, if you are not satisfied with your grade, but recognize that it was not due to a fault in the grading, I encourage you to talk with me to learn how to improve on future assignments.

## Students with Disabilities

In compliance with university policy and equal access laws, I am available to discuss appropriate academic accommodations that you may require as a student with a disability. Request for academic accommodations should be made during the first week of the term, except for unusual circumstances, so arrangements can be made. Students are required to register for disability verification and for determination of reasonable academic accommodations. For more information, visit

<http://www.cmu.edu/hr/eos/disability/students/index.html>

## Sexual Harassment Policy

It is the policy of the university that no male or female member of the university community (i.e., students, faculty, administrators, or staff) may sexually harass any other member of the community. Sexual advances, requests for sexual favors, and other verbal or physical conduct of a sexual nature constitute harassment when:

- Submission to such conduct is made or threatened to be made, either explicitly or implicitly, a term or condition of an individual's employment or education; or
- Submission to or rejection of such conduct is used or threatened to be used as the basis for academic or employment decisions affecting that individual; or
- Such conduct has the purpose or effect of substantially interfering with an individual's academic or professional performance or creating what a reasonable person would sense as an intimidating, hostile, or offensive employment, educational, or living environment.

For more information, visit

<http://www.cmu.edu/policies/documents/SexHarass.html>

## A Note on Classroom Courtesy

Classes begin at 1:00PM. You are expected to be seated by that time and to remain seated until the class is dismissed. If you must leave before the class ends because of a medical appointment, or similar commitment, notify me before class begins and sit near the door. Students who leave without providing such notice and have not suddenly taken ill will be expected to drop the course and not to return.

## Video Taping and Audio Recording

Your classmates and I have a reasonable expectation to not be recorded in this course. Therefore, videotaping and audio recording are prohibited without our expressed, unanimous permission.

## Cell Phones, Laptops, and Other Related Technologies

Student interactions with portable technology devices can harm the dynamics of the classroom. Therefore, I expect you to silence your cell phones prior to class and to not text-message during class. *All laptops should be closed unless you have made prior arrangements with me and have demonstrated that using a laptop is necessary for your learning.*

## Cheating and Plagiarism

**plagiarism** (plā'jĕ-rĭz'ĕm) *n* 1: a piece of writing that has been copied from someone else and is presented as being your own work. 2: the act of plagiarizing; taking someone's words or ideas as if they were your own.

Plagiarism is bad. Do not do it. It amounts to lying, cheating, and stealing. Anyone caught doing it can fairly assume that they will not pass this course.

To encourage proper citing of sources, [www.TurnItIn.com](http://www.TurnItIn.com) will be used for submitting all your assignments. Beyond this, it is the responsibility of each student to be aware of the university policies on academic integrity, including the policies on cheating and plagiarism. This information is available at

<http://www.cmu.edu/policies/documents/Cheating.html>

Also see the section on "University Policies" in the most recent edition of *The Word: Undergraduate Student Handbook*.

Students who cheat or plagiarize face serious sanctions at both the course level, and the university level. At the course level, faculty at Carnegie Mellon University have significant discretion to determine the sanctions that are appropriate to individual cases of cheating and plagiarism. Within the Philosophy Department, it is customary to give plagiarized assignments a failing grade and, where appropriate, to fail students for the course. Additionally, a letter is sent to the Dean of Students indicating that the student in question has submitted plagiarized material and received a course-level sanction. Plagiarism is also a violation of the community standards of Carnegie Mellon University. As such, allegations of plagiarism may be brought before a University Academic Review Board, which will determine whether a violation of community standards has taken place and level additional sanctions if appropriate. Although this body also has significant discretion over the sanctions that it levels, plagiarism can result in academic probation, suspension, and even expulsion.

---

# Using TurnItIn

## Setting Up Your TurnItIn Account

For this course, I will be using TurnItIn to assist me in verifying that each of your papers is an original piece of scholarly work. For those of you not familiar with this website, you submit a copy of each of your papers to it, and TurnItIn examines your work against its database of papers and websites. This allows me to quickly confirm that you are correctly citing your sources. I will then print your papers myself, so you do *not* need to hand in any hardcopies to me.

Before you can turn anything in, you must set up an account on TurnItIn and get it connected to this course. This is a relatively painless process so do not be scared. Of course, you are a CMU student, which means you should already be friendly with technology and have already hacked into this website and are capable of making it do your bidding. On the other hand, if computers frighten you then find a classmate who may help you set up your account.

Regardless, follow these simple instructions in order to begin your journey on the path of originality:

1. Get a computer with Internet access.
2. Open up a web browser and go to: <http://www.TurnItIn.com>.
3. You may be asked to select your language. If so, please click on [English \(US\)](#). (Beyond English, I know Ancient Greek and Latin, neither of which is useful for guaranteeing that these instructions work for any of the site's other supported languages.)
4. Now look towards the top right of the webpage and click on [Create Account](#).
5. On the next screen, look for the section entitled "Create a New Account". In that section, click on [student](#).
6. On the next screen, enter the following information:

class ID:	<b>3712801</b>
class enrollment password:	<b>plato</b>

Enter your (real) first and last name, along with your *university* email address (or whatever email address you actually check).

Make up a password (and *write it down!* No seriously, write it down *right now!* Just write it here: \_\_\_\_\_) and enter it into the two fields.

Select a secret question from the pull down menu and then type the answer in the space provided.

Unless you are a child prodigy, please tick the circle next to "I am at least 13 years of age".

Finally, read and understand the license agreement, or (like me) just skip it and click the "I agree -- create profile" button.

7. On the next screen it should say you are now setup and enrolled in my class. And so you are done. Ignore the instructions it gives you. You do not need to turn anything in right now—unless, of course, you put this off until the first paper was due!

## Turning It In with TurnItIn

Now that you have set up your TurnItIn account, you are now ready to submit your highly original papers. Please note that you are expected to submit all papers via the TurnItIn website *before* their respective due date/time in order to avoid a late penalty. The website is set to stop accepting papers after that time. Turning in a hardcopy in class is not required as long as the paper has been successfully submitted to TurnItIn.

In order to turn in your first assignment, please follow these instructions:

1. Finish the assignment. Make sure it is all in a *single* text file (acceptable formats are MS Word, WordPerfect, PostScript, PDF, HTML, RTF, and plain text) on a computer.
2. Find a computer with Internet access and put your paper's file on it.
3. Open up a web browser and go to: <http://www.TurnItIn.com>.
4. You may be asked to "Select your language". If so, please click on [English \(US\)](#). (See previous instructions for my esoteric knowledge of foreign languages.)
5. Look towards the top right of the webpage and enter your email address and password (which you had better have written down) and then click on the "SIGN IN" button.
6. On the next screen, click on [80-348 - Health, Development, and Human Ri...](#)
7. On the next screen, click the "Submit" button next to the name of the assignment you wish to turn in.
8. On the next screen, select "single file upload" from the pull down menu. Do *not* use "cut & paste upload", as it will remove all your document's precious formatting!

Your first and last name should already be filled in.

For the submission title enter "My Assignment" (or "Plato Approved" or something else witty and clever).

Then click the "Choose File" button to find the location of the assignment's file on the computer.

Finally, click the "upload" button and wait patiently until your file has indeed been uploaded.

9. On the next screen, make sure this is the file you wish to submit and then click the "submit" button.
10. On the next screen, it should that your submission was successful. Now you are almost done. Please *save a copy* of this "TurnItIn Digital Receipt" so that, in case anything goes wrong, I can verify that you turned it in on time. It is *your responsibility* to do this. Failure to do so means that you will not be absolved of any late penalties. Now you are really done. Congratulations.

If any problems occur when trying to submit, please email a copy of your assignment to me *before* the posted date and time that the assignment is due. I can then submit the paper for you. If you cannot do this, then you must submit a hardcopy to me personally to avoid a late penalty (and I must actually have the paper in hand before the due date/time).