

# HEALTH, DEVELOPMENT & HUMAN RIGHTS

---

## Entitlement & Just Holdings

As you read the material for our next class, keep the questions below in mind. To answer these questions you will have to reflect critically on what you have read and possibly re-read important passages. Keep in mind that there are two basic kinds of information that you need to look for in the reading:

1. What are the main points or conclusions that an author accepts with respect to a particular issue?
2. What are the reasons, important considerations, and evidence that lead the author to accept that conclusion?

For our purposes, *it is information of the second sort that will be our primary concern* since our most basic task is to *evaluate the reasons and evidence* that are offered to support accepting one possible conclusion about an issue, rather than another.

Although I strongly suggest that you write out brief answers to these questions, you do not have to turn in written responses. You do, however, need to be prepared to speak intelligently about these issues at our next class meeting.

### Reading

- Robert Nozick, *Anarchy, State, and Utopia*.

### Questions

1. What is Nozick's entitlement theory of justice? Based on this theory, under what conditions would developed countries be morally obligated to provide foreign aid to those in extreme poverty?
2. Nozick presents his famous "Wilt Chamberlain" example to illustrate problems with patterned theories of justice. (Chamberlain was a famous basketball player. If you prefer, think about another famous athlete like Kobe Bryant or Lionel Messi.) What problems is this example supposed to reveal about patterned theories?
3. Nozick sees similarities between his view and that of John Locke when it comes to providing the conditions for someone to be entitled to their property (i.e, for someone to have just holdings or to have acquired their property justly). What puzzles does Nozick see with Locke's "mixing argument"? How does Nozick propose to justify the just acquisition of private property with something like the "Lockean proviso"?