

# BUSINESS, SOCIETY & ETHICS

## Debate #6: This House Believes Commercial Reproductive Surrogacy is Legitimate Business

### Proposition Teams

Prop 1                      Prop 2                      Prop 3

### Opposition Teams

Opp 1                      Opp 2                      Opp 3

### Background Material

- Case Study, "Renting a Womb".
- Lindsay Murdoch, "Australian Couple Leaves Down Syndrome Baby with Thai Surrogate" (article & video).
- Eryk Bagshaw, "Australian Couple Abandons Surrogate Baby in India".

This material is in no way exhaustive. Indeed, I fully expect that you and your team will conduct additional research in order to better equip yourself for debate preparation and the debate position paper.

### Preparation Outline

**Due:** Thursday, April 16<sup>th</sup> by 8:00AM via Blackboard.

Late preparation outlines will *not* be accepted unless you have requested and I have granted a *prior* reasonable accommodation.

Only one person on your team needs to submit your outline. Unless I tell you otherwise, each member of your group will receive the same grade on this outline.

**Instructions:** Your outline should be 1,100–1,300 words in length and conform to the course's "General Technical Requirements for Written Assignments" from page 12 of the syllabus.

Your team's assignment is to prepare an outline of its position and defense. The over-arching goal is to present a reasoned defense of your team's position that would assist you in defending yourself against someone who disagrees. Your team's outline must clearly do the following two items:

1. Justify and defend your team's position, and
2. Critique and reject the other team's position.

Each part should be about a half of the total outline. In writing this, please assume that your readers are not familiar with the debate's motion—so explain and organize the outline as clearly as possible.

I will leave it to your team to decide how to fairly distribute this work load.

### Peer Evaluation

**Due:** Thursday, April 16<sup>th</sup> by 8:00AM via Blackboard.

Late peer evaluations will *not* be accepted unless you have requested and I have granted a *prior* reasonable accommodation.

Failure to submit an evaluation will result in a 0.10 point (i.e., one-tenth letter grade) deduction from your end-of-semester debate preparation outline grade.

**Instructions:** Your peer evaluations should include the names of your team members and assign each of them a grade following the 10-point scale from page 1 of the syllabus. (You may use up to two decimal places, e.g. 8.55, if that is meaningful to you.) You are free, but not required, to include comments if you feel it necessary to explain your evaluations.

At the end of the semester, I will calculate your average peer evaluation. I will then subtract 9.00 from this average. The result is added to your end-of-semester debate preparation outline grade. So if the result is positive, that *boosts* your grade. But if the result is negative, that *reduces* your grade.

**Note:** If you are having trouble getting in touch with your team members, please let me know immediately. I will do my best to get you all in contact with each other. Furthermore, if you are experiencing difficulties working with another group member, please let me know immediately. I will do my best to help resolve the situation to everyone's satisfaction.

## Debate #6:

# This House Believes Commercial Reproductive Surrogacy is Legitimate Business (Continued)

### In-Class Debate 🧑 + 🧑

**Date:** Thursday, April 16<sup>th</sup>.

At the beginning of class this day, I will randomly select one proposition and one opposition team to debate in front of the class. Being unable to debate at that time results in all team members receiving a 0.00 (R).

**Format:** Each team member must speak exactly once for five minutes. The order of the speeches during the debate will be as follows:

1. **First Proposition Speaker:** Presentation of the argument supporting the motion.
2. **First Opposition Speaker:** Presentation of the argument rejecting the motion.
3. **Second Proposition Speaker:** Exposition of flaws in opposition's argument.
4. **Second Opposition Speaker:** Exposition of flaws in proposition's argument.
5. **Third Proposition Speaker:** Closing summary of proposition's argument and why this persuasively responds to all of the opposition's criticisms.
6. **Third Opposition Speaker:** Closing summary of the opposition's argument and why this persuasively responds to all of the proposition's criticisms.

I will leave it to your team to decide when each of its member will speak.

Following the debate, we will have a vote on which team offered the strongest and most compelling argument about the motion. The team with the most votes will earn a prize. The remainder of time opens the floor to questions and comments by the entire class.

### Position Paper 🧑

**Due:** Thursday, April 23<sup>rd</sup> by 12:00PM (noon) via Blackboard.

Late position papers will not be accepted unless you have requested and I have granted a prior reasonable accommodation.

At the end of class on the day of the debate, I will randomly select students who will be required to do this paper. You are always free to volunteer to do it. You only have to do one of these papers during this semester, so once you have done it, you never need to do another.

**Instructions:** Your paper should be 1,100–1,300 words in length and conform to the course's "General Technical Requirements for Written Assignments" from page 12 of the syllabus.

Your assignment is to state a clear thesis of agreement or disagreement with the debate's motion and then provide a reasoned *argument* in support of that position. Please do not provide a list of "possible positions" e.g., "one might say x, or one might say y . . ." Simply state *your* position and defend it. In doing so, be clear about the following four items:

1. The statement of your position on the debate's motion,
2. The premises or reasons you are using to justify that position,
3. The reasons why these premises are plausible and difficult to deny, and
4. The inferences showing how these premises support your position.

This is still a pretty short paper, so remember to *stay focused*. It should be clear to the reader how your every word, sentence, and paragraph is doing one of these four things.

You have read material for this class that relates to this topic, so you are free to draw upon any of this material if it is relevant to your argument. Please cite any material that you draw upon, if you do so. However,

please do not waste space with unnecessary quotation. I am primarily interested in *your* views. However, do not assume that your reader is familiar with the topic, so you must explain your argument to them as clearly as possible.

For this paper, you should not write an extensive introduction. Your introduction should only give a brief sketch—in one short paragraph with no more than three or four sentences—of the issue you are addressing and the position you will defend in the paper. Do not summarize your argument here. The purpose of this introduction is to give readers unfamiliar with the topic some relevant background information so that they may easily understand your position. Furthermore, your reader will know immediately what you will be defending throughout the paper. Any further background information is typically best included as needed in the paper's body.

In general, the statement of your position is one sentence that clearly states the claim that the body of the paper will defend. Do not be coy in stating your position. Be blunt and clear about what it is. There is nothing wrong with the last sentence of your introduction simply saying, "In this paper, I will argue [position]." This gives your paper focus, conveying to the reader exactly what it is they should expect from you.

The body of the paper should then present your argument for justifying your position in response to the debate's motion.

This paper should have *no conclusion*. That is, there should be no concluding paragraph summarizing your paper or explaining any of the consequences that result from accepting your argument; your paper is already short enough, and so such a summary is not needed.

**General Advice:** In order to write the position paper, there is no where else to look, nor is there anyone else to ask, for the right answer. It is up to you to reflect on the position you are willing to defend as the most compelling. Keep in mind that, if you were selected for this debate, that this position may not be the same one your team was prepared to defend. Once you are clear in your mind about your own position on the debate's motion, then you can begin to identify the strongest reasons to offer in support of that position. Once you have done all that, you can finally assemble all this into your position paper.

I also encourage you to creatively explore this topic. Even so, while you have freedom in terms of your paper's style and argumentative structure, remember that it is your *argument* that must always clear to your reader. Do not let stylistic elements distract from your paper's primary purpose, which is to provide a reasoned defense of your position. Entertaining your reader has extremely low priority.

### Collaboration & Academic Integrity 🧑

Please be aware that academic integrity demands that each group work on its own in preparing for the debate and that each student work on his or her own in writing the position paper.

That said, everyone remains free to discuss the debate's motion, share related articles and other links, and so on, via Twitter using the course hashtag **#BSE15**. However, if you use anything from another person in your preparation outline or in your position paper, please cite it, e.g., as "From a tweet by @TwitterName" or "From a discussion with Person's Name".

I always encourage you to talk about these issues with your classmates and others. Learning with and from others is great! But I also expect that your team writes its own preparation outline and that you write your own position paper, all while being honest about any assistance you may have received in doing so.